PROVISION FOR POST PROJECT EVALUATIONS FOR THE UNITED NATIONS DEMOCRACY FUND
Contract NO.PD:C0110/10

UDF-RUS-09-332 - Empowering Civil Society Organizations of Migrants and Ethnic Minorities in the Russian Federation

I. Executive Summary

(i) Project Data

This report is the evaluation of the project ñEmpowering Civil Society Organizations of Migrants and Ethnic Minoritiesò implemented from August 2010 to June 2012 by the Center for Assistance to Victims of Violence and Human Trafficking (CAVT). The UNDEF grant amount was US$225,000, with USD 22,500 retained by UNDEF for monitoring and evaluation purposes. The total budget of the project was US$260,000, thanks to a US$35,000 co-financing amount. According to the original project document, the projectôs objective was to ñempower the civil society organizations established by migrants and ethnic minorities in order to strengthen their access to justice, ability to combat xenophobia and discrimination, and to promote their social integration and interaction with Russian government bodies and NGOsò.

The project objective was to ñempower civil society organizations established by migrants and ethnic minoritiesò to ñstrengthen their access to justice, ability to combat xenophobia and discrimination, and promote their social integration and interaction with governmental bodies and NGOsò. Flowing from this objective of support to migrants and ethnic minorities organizations, the project strategy had three prongs:

Identification of the target organizationsôdevelopment and advocacy needs;

Training of the organizations and other stakeholders (7( )-438(acce)3(ss)-438(t)-4(o)-437(

The project was effective

thought-out. However, t**he project did not fully address migrant NGOs' capacity** building needs because it was designed to address knowledge gaps concerning the rights of migrants, and did not address other constraints on NGOsôcapacity to act.

The project was effective . The activities were implemented as planned and results were achieved, largely because of the expertise of trainers and of the implementing NGOôs record of previous effective work with stakeholders, The project was generally efficient as resources were used appropriately and project management was responsive. The project achieved impact, including through changed knowledge among NGO representatives and institutional stakeholders. It was also noticeable in relation to journalistsô understanding of migrant and ethnic minority issues. The project lacked sustainability , because there was a lack of attention paid to NGOsôcapacity building and governance. The project also failed to address sufficiently the issue of NGO advocacy on behalf of migrants and ethnic minorities.

(iv) Recommendations

These recommendations stem from the findings and conclusions. They are addressed to CAVT, the implementing organization ï except the last one, which is addressed to UNDEF.

- CAVT should consider future projects in support of capacity building for migrant and ethnic minorities NGOs.
- Future projects should reinforce the capacity building of NGOs in terms of governance and use of resources.
- CAVT should ensure that future projects should have more formal advocacy strategies.
- CAVT should consider addressing economic actors in future projects, including employers of migrant workers.
- CAVT should consider a specific awareness-raising project directed at the media.

II. Introduction and development context

(i) Project and evaluation objectives

This report is the evaluation of the project "Empowering Civil Society Organizations of

(iii) Development context

Ethnic minorities in Russia

At the latest census in 2010, the Russian Federationôs population (just under 143 million) was estimated to be 81% ethnic Russian, the rest being made up by members of about 160 officially recognized ethnic groups, the largest of which are the Tatars (3.7% of the population), Ukrainians (1.4%), Bashk8e.5sz

ll153(f)e2738(po)3(pu)3(l)5(atio)3(.( )376(Fno)15()7(( )]TJETBT1 0 0 1

(%) an ash (%).t All the ( )]TJETBT1 0 0 1 305.09 595276 T

and 200,000 since 2009.[3] Much of this immigration was legal in the sense that immigrants had the right to stay in Russia, but a high proportion (which the paper mentioned in the footnote below assessed at about 70%) did not have the legal right to work ñbecause most employers reject employeesô requests to formalize their hireò.

A development in the last several years concerned trafficking. Whereas Russia and

III. Project strategy

(i) Project approach and strategy

Initial design and implementation
The project objective was to ñempower civil society organizations established by migrants and ethnic minoritiesò to ñstrengthen their access to justice, ability to combat xenophobia and discrimination, and promote their social integration and interaction with governmental bodies and NGOsò

Flowing from this objective of support to migrants and ethnic minorities organizations, the project strategy had three prongs:

- Identification of the target organizationsô development and advocacy needs;
- Training of the organizations and other stakeholders (police, social services, media, other NGOs, Ombudsman institutions, etc.);
- Networking among target organizations and with other stakeholders.

In addition, the project planned to hold workshops with human rights NGOs and trade

Conference on the above issues, with NGOS and officials.

(ii) Intervention logic

The table below summarizes the intervention logic, based on the project document.

Baseline study

IV. Evaluation findings

The following findings stem from the evidence gathered by the evaluator.

(i) Relevance

The project was relevant in that it appropriately identified three key needs:

The capacity development needs of NGOs working on behalf of migrant workers and ethnic minorities;

The need to engage law enforcement officials and state institutions in awareness raising activities and dissemination of good practices relating to migrants and minorities;

- The need to ensure better coordination and collaboration among NGOs supporting migrant workers and ethnic minorities, in Russia and in the countries of origin.

In addition to these key needs, the project sought to address other related but lower-priority concerns, including:

The Russian mediaÕs coverage of events involving migrants and ethnic minorities can be perceived as xenophobic. In case of violence involving migrants, CAVT found that the media tended to take a partial view, partly because no one would speak publicly on behalf of migrants in such situations.

The attitude of law enforcement officials, some of who may deal with migrants as possible extremists. That situation is made worse by the lack of action in this field on the part of regional ombudsmen, who have been wary of taking up complaints by migrants.

The failure of migrant NGOs themselves to conduct adequate advocacy activities on behalf of migrants. CAVT noted that, prior to the project, NGOs rarely lobbied regional authorT1 0 0 1 352.27 ,C /P /MCID 28/Lang (en-US)[()-1

(ii) Effectiveness

The project was effective. The planned activities were virtually all implemented as foreseen in the original proposal, and sometimes ï for example in terms of number of participants in training sessions ï went beyond the planned indicators. Here is an overview of the effectiveness of the project in terms of activities implemented:

The training sessions involved almost twice as many participants (police, other institutions, as well as NGOs) as originally planned, largely thanks to a higher than expected number of sessions with police. Participants provided positive feedback on the scope of the training, the quality of the knowledge provided and the expertise of the trainers. Some institutional participants noted, however, that it was difficult to implement some of the recommended good practices in the existing institutional context of policy towards migrants.

The publications (handbook for NGOs, police training curriculum) were also praised by participants and appeared to the evaluator to be comprehensive in their coverage. In the view of the evaluator, the documents only lacked an adequate number of practical case studies based on actual events. Such case studies would

Other stakeholders, particularly law enforcement officials, also acknowledged the capacity development dimension of their attendance to training seminars.

Networking among stakeholders also increased through meetings during the seminars and workshops.

The project was also able to address the issue of xenophobic reporting in some media. In this regard, the involvement of journalists in training seminars was effective. According to the Perm representative of the Russian JournalistsôUnion, the participation of journalists in various project events resulted in contacts being established between local media, migrantsô NGOs, police and the Perm Ombudsmanôs office, which in turn led to more balanced reporting about migration issues in the local press. The media representative noted that a series of three roundtable in Perm, with CAVTôs support, led for the first time to direct dialogues between journalists and senior municipal police officers. Despite this sign of progress, however, the project was not able to address a sufficient number of journalists and media outlets to reach a critical mass able to influence the general tone of reporting about migrants. A larger, media-focused project would be necessary to achieve this objective.

(iii) Efficiency

The project was efficient, in the sense that its resources were appropriately used to deliver the planned results and that activities were implemented within budget and delivered to an appropriate standard. Appropriate budget design and sound project management contributed to the efficiency of the project. This is noteworthy in the context of Russia, which is a relatively high-costs economy, particularly in Moscow and other large cities. The main areas of expense were the following:

Staff costs. The project team (project director, assistant, training coordinator and accountant) cost under $38,000, which was appropriate for a project with total project costs in slight excess of $200,000.

The largest costs were for the seminars in Perm and Moscow and for the conference in Perm, which had a total budget of $80,000.

Further major costs were related to the training materials for NGOs, police, media and others, which cost over $40,000 ï a cost justified by the large print-run and distribution costs around the country.

Project management

The project was managed efficiently and responsively, addressing the needs of target NGOs and stakeholders as they arose. CAVTôs location in Perm obviously led to prioritizing the Perm regional stakeholders in many activities, but national stakeholders in Moscow were also involved. The project director also used travel across Russian regions (sometimes for other activities) to support the work of regional stakeholders in Siberia and elsewhere.

The only weakness of the project management ï stemming also from its design ï has been the relatively short-term focus on project activities, to the detriment of the attempt to achieve a longer-term impact. For example, little was done within 2b,.he re41(-).-4(he)3( )-36(r)-3(e)5(b2

Advice on project cycle management to help NGOs make the best possible use of their existing human and financial resources;
Advice on good governance and accountability practices, taking into account Russian legal requirements on NGOS;
Training on the development of advocacy strategy, from analysis of audiences to message development techniques and stakeholders analysis.

Despite these limitations, the project has given CAVT a good base to engage further with institutions on follow

Government skepticism towards some human rights NGOs has increased over the last 10 years. However, CAVTôs record shows that it is possibl is poŒ q ‘ ï˜ ɹ ƫ ž ɔ m V]

VI. Recommendations

In this section, recommendations (i) to (iii) are addressed to CAVT and the last one to UNDEF. The recommendations are based on the findings and conclusions set out above.

Recommendation to CAVT

(i) CAVT should consider future projects in support of capacity building for migrant and ethnic minorities NGOs .

CAVT has excellent expertise and record of credibility in the field of human rights of migrants and ethnic minorities. It also has excellent project design and management experience, and carries credibility with institutional stakeholders.

(ii) Future projects should reinforce the capacity building of NGOs in terms of governance and use of resources .

In addition to current work focusing on capacity building in the protection and promotion of migrantsô rights, CAVT should also help NGOs address governance and project management challenges, with a view to make the best possible use of their limited resources.

(iii) Future projects should have more formal advocacy strategies.

Any new project that aims at building the capacity of migrant and ethnic minority NGOs should also build their advocacy capacity, by training NGO representatives in the development of sound advocacy strategies. This should include stakeholders analysis, message development, and provide advice on good advocacy practices.

(iv) CAVT should consider addressing economic actors in future projects, including employers of migrant workers.

Employers are important stakeholders, with direct influence on the welfare of migrant workers. It is often soufuilto lagalivo the itdations of s workor hat ldao 6-4(o)13( )]TJETBT1 0 0 1 70.8242

Annex 2: Documents Reviewed:

In addition to standard project documents submitted to UNDEF by CAVT (original project document, mid-term and final review, the evaluation considered the following elements provided by CAVT (in Russian):

Handbook for NGOs on the rights of migrants and ethnic minorities;

Training manual for police and other law enforcement agencies on the situation and rights of migrants and ethnic minorities, including issues of sexual violence

Annex 3: Persons Interviewed

Name	Position
Fedor Sinitsyn	Director, CAVT
Tursunoy Alimardonova	Director, TUMW
Erenat Karimov	

Annex 4: Acronyms

CAVT	Center for Assistance to Victims of Violence and Human Trafficking
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
NGO	Non-governmental organization
TUMW	Trade Union of Migrant Workers