# UNITED NATIONS APPEALS TRIBUNAL TRIBUNAL D'APPEL DES NATIONS UNIES

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

# Moner Ahmed Nasser (Appellant)

v.

Commissioner-General
of the United Nations Relief and Works Agency
for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
(Respondent)

### **JUDGMENT**

Bc 0 3()Tj m38B523.8 394.322544.322544.322544.54-(8an41 Td[(Bc&MCID 5-22.197 -1.1 T12 -0 :-1

Counsel for Appellant: Self-represented

Counsel for Respondent: Natalie Boucly

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

#### JUDGE GAO XIAOLI, PRESIDING.

- 1. Mr. Moner Ahmed Nasser¹ (Mr. Nasser) contested the decision of the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA or Agency) to impose on him the disciplinary measure of separation from service (contested decision).
- 2. By Summary Judgment No. UNRWA/DT/2022/038 <sup>2</sup> (impugned Judgment), the Dispute Tribunal of UNRWA (UNRWA DT or UNRWA Dispute Tribunal) concluded that Mr. Nasser filed his application with the UNRWA DT more than three years after his receipt of the contested decision and therefore rejected his application as not receivable *ratione temporis* pursuant to Article 8(4) of the UNRWA Dispute Tribunal Statute.
- 3. Mr. Nasser lodged an appeal o7 (r E)-7.3 (a)6.7 (cTw 1T5 1)1.7 (.)3cla4734 0 Td[(co)-1.7 (n)6.8 a

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

- 7. By letter dated 3 November 2009, the Officer-in-Charge of UNRWA Operations in Gaza informed Mr. Nasser that it had been established that he had committed serious misconduct in respect of which the disciplinary measure of separation from service with compensation in lieu of notice was imposed pursuant to UNRWA Area Staff Regulations 9.1 and 9.3.<sup>5</sup>
- 8. On 12 June 2022, Mr. Nasser requested a decision review of the decision of the Officer-in-Charge of UNRWA Operations in Gaza to impose on him the disciplinary measure of separation from service.
- 9. The Agency did not inform Mr. Nasser of the outcome of the decision review.<sup>6</sup>
- 10. On 12 August 2022, Mr. Nasser filed an application with the UNRWA Dispute Tribunal contesting the decision to impose on him the disciplinary measure of separation from service.

#### Impugned Judgment

11. On 22 August 2022, the UNRWA Dispute Tribunal issued the impugned Judgment by way of summary judgment pursuant to Article 5 of the UNRWA Dispute Tribunal Rules of Procedure. <sup>7</sup> It concluded that Mr. Nasser was informed of the contested decision on 3 November 2009 and filed his application with the UNRWA Dispute Tribunal on 12 August 2022. Therefore, it rejected his application as not receivable *ratione temporis* pursuant to Article 8(4) of the UNRWA DT Statute because he filed it more than three years after his receipt of the contested decision.<sup>8</sup>

#### Procedures before the Appeals Tribunal

12. On 14 October 2022, Mr. Nasser filed an appeal of the impugned Judgment with the Appeals Tribunal, to which the Commissioner-General responded on 16 December 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Letter of termination of appointment of 3 November 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Agency, on behalf of the Deputy Commissioner-General of UNRWA, wrote two e-mails to Mr. Nasser following his request for a decision review. In a first e-mail, the Agency acknowledged receipt of his request for a decision rev9b.3 a4uP1e17.(o)-(a)r6.0PMCar60-14.9 1Tc 0 Tw 4.386 3 Td[(t)-40 stio f e

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

13. On 4 January 2023, Mr. Nasser filed a motion requesting permission to file additional pleadings, to which the Commissioner-General did not respond.										

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

- 25. The Commissioner-General argues that Mr. Nasser failed to identify reversible errors and that the UNRWA Dispute Tribunal did not err on a question of fact, as a matter of law or in procedure in dismissing his application as not receivable *ratione temporis*.
- 26. Finally, the Commissioner-General submits that the reliefs sought by Mr. Nasser have no legal basis and requests that the Appeals Tribunal dismisses the appeal.

#### Mr. Nasser's Motion to file additional pleadings

27. In his Motion to file additional pleadings, Mr. Nasser contends that the e-mail of the Agency of 12 July 2022 is an element that was annexed to his application and thus put forward before the UNRWA DT.

#### **Considerations**

#### Motion to file additional pleadings

28. We have considered Mr. Nasser's Motion requesting permission to file additional pleadings and, in accordance with Article 31(1) of the Appeals Tribunal Rules of Procedure and Section II.A.3 of Practice Direction No. 1 of the Appeals Tribunal, we reject it since these additional pleadings are of no consequences to the outcome of the present case. Indeed, we find that even if the additional pleadings were to be admitted, they could not assist Mr. Nasser as he wishes, and his appeal would still fail \( \text{\

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

#### 30. Article 8 of the UNRWA DT Statute provides:

...

- 3. The Dispute Tribunal may decide in writing, upon written request by the applicant, to suspend, waive or extend the deadlines for a limited period of time and only in exceptional cases. The Dispute Tribunal shall not suspend, waive or extend the deadlines for decision review.
- 4. Notwithstanding paragraph 3 of the present article, an application shall not be receivable if it is filed more than three years after the applicant's receipt of the contested administrative decision.
- 31. With regard to the time limits for filing applications, Article 3 of the UNRWA DT Rules of Procedure establishes:

...

- 5. In accordance with Article 8.4 of the Statute of the Dispute Tribunal, no application shall be receivable if filed more than three years after the Applicant's receipt of the contested administrative decision.
- 32. Mr. Na n IJ/TT3 4 79.2017 r7 (e)-7 m0.w 1.946sTT1 1 Tf-0.e795 ]TJ0 Tc 0 Tw (h)2.7 (33 Tw -2.0 Td( 7012

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

	The	UNRWA	Dispute	Tribunal	found1	(l f3.7	4(T)75(ounatTm[([(T	M)7	(d)r.1	(oun.)-7	(ie)-8

# The United N

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1360

	Judgment									
44.	Mr. y affiri		appeal	is	dismissed,	and	Judgment	No.	UNRWA/DT/2022/038	is
nereb	y anni	ineu.								
Origii	nal and	l Authorita	ative Ver	sio	n: English	1				
Decis	ion da	ted this 30	<sup>th</sup> day of	Jui	ne 2023 in N	lew Y	ork, United	State	s.	
	(.	(Signed)			(S	igneo	d)		(Signed)	
Ju	dge X	iaoli, Pres	siding		Judg	e San	dhu		Judge Colgan	
_	nent p d State		and ente	ered	l into the Ro	egiste:	r on this 24	ł <sup>th</sup> da	y of July 2023 in New Yo	rk,
		(Signed)								
Ju	liet Jo	hnson, Re	egistrar							