11. By Order No. 269 (NY/2013) of 23 October 2013, the Tribunal convened the parties to a case management discussion to address, inter alia, the transfer of the case to Geneva. The case management hearing was held on 13 November 2013 and by Order No. 314 (NY/2013) of 1 November 2013, the Tribunal directed the parties to file a joint submission on all outstanding matters, including whether there had any objections to a transfer of the case to the Geneva Registry.

12. In a joint submission filed by the parties on 9 December 2013, the Respondent did not object to the transfer of the case to the Geneva Registry. The Applicants noted that they were not confident that the transfer to Geneva would expedite the case given the anticipated need for hearings on technical issues, since most potential witnesses were in New York and Bangkok). They stressed, however, that they would have no objection in principle, should the Tribunal consider that the request for expedition could be best ensured by the transfer. By Order No. 333 (NY/2013) of the same day, the Tribunal ordered the transfer of the case to the Geneva Registry, where it was registered under case No. UNDT/GVA/2013/069, and assigned to the undersigned Judge.

Proceedings in Geneva

13. By Order No. 14 (GVA/2014) of 22 January 2014, the Tribunal informed the parties that the Judge now in charge of the case had decided to raise at his own motion the issue of the application's receivability ratione materiae; it therefore requested the parties to submit comments thereon by Wednesday, 12 February 2014. In that Order, the Tribunal also informed the parties that the case would be decided on the papers, without an oral hearing.

14. Both parties submitted their comments on the issue of the application's receivability ratione materiae on 12 February 2014.

15. In 2 January 2011, the first meeting of the Local Joint Survey Committee (LJSC), comprising 60 members appointed by both staff

(e0(esentat+-es and management\$ too) 0/a,e\$ +n 0(e0a(at+on of t%e 2011 Com0(e%ens+-e Do,a/ 7a/a(# 7u(-e#.

16.   !n 26 A0(+/ 2011\$ t%e 4B^t% meet+ng of t%e Un+ted Nat+ons !0e(at+ons "anagement Team 3;!"T=4 too) 0/a,e +n 2ang)o)\$ at &%+,% +t &as +nd+,ated t%at ;t%e Nat+ona/ !ff+,e(s,a/e a00ea(ed to 1e on t%e %+g% s+de= and t%at ;t%e Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e s,a/e a/so a00ea(ed %+g%=.

1@.   T%e 2011 Com0(e%ens+-e Do,a/ 7a/a(# 7u(-e# &as ,ondu,ted f(om June to De,em1e(2011.

1B.   !n 10 Janua(# 2012\$ an D77C meet+ng &as %e/d\$ to ,ons+de(and s+gn t%e D77C (e0o(t 0(e0a(ed 1# t%e sa/a(# su(-e# s0e,+a/+sts\$ 1# 11 Janua(# 2013\$ fo(0(esentat+on to t%e Eead9ua(te(s 7a/a(# 7tee(+ng Comm+ttee. T%e (esu/ts of t%e su(-e# +nd+,ated t%at Un+ted Nat+ons sa/a(+es fo(t%e Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e and Nat+ona/ !ff+,e(,atego(+es &e(e %+g%e(t%an t%ose of t%e (eta+ned ,om0a(ato(s\$ 1# 2@.2 F and 41.4 F (es0e,t+-e/#.

19.   !n 13 Janua(# 2012\$ t%e f+nd+ngs of t%e sa/a(# su(-e# s0e,+a/+sts &e(e 0(esented to t%e Eead9ua(te(s 7a/a(# 7tee(+ng Comm+ttee\$ &%+,% unan+mous/#

t%e su(-e# &as ,ondu,ted 1# ,e(ta+n "anagement (e0(esentat+-es &+t% t%e 0(eℍ dete(m+ned agenda to (edu,e t%e sa/a(# s,a/e fo(staff +n t%e Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e and Nat+ona/ !ff+,e(,atego(+es.

22. !n 29 8e1(ua(# 2012 and 2 "a(,% 2012$ to&n %a// meet+ngs too) 0/a,e &+t% t%e Unde(7e,(eta(#ℍGene(a/$ De0a(tment of "anagement$ and t%e Ass+stant 7e,(eta(#ℍGene(a/ fo(Euman *esou(,es "anagement$ (es0e,t+-e/#$ at &%+,% t%e 2011 Com0(e%ens+-e Do,a/ 7a/a(# 7u(-e# &as d+s,ussed.

23. 7ome mem1e(s of t%e D77C &(ote to t%e Ass+stant 7e,(eta(#ℍGene(a/ fo(

of t%e 0(o,ess fo(dete(m+n+ng /o,a//# (e,(u+ted staff sa/a(# s,a/es at nonⵀEead9ua(te(s dut# stat+ons=.

2@. T%e A00/+,antsᴀ 0(+n,+0a/ ,ontent+ons a(e:

a. T%e *es0ondent %as not ,ontested t%e T(+1una/ᴀs ‹u(+sd+,t+on to ,ons+de(,/a+ms &+t% (es0e,t to t%e a00/+,at+on of t%e 6C7C met%odo/og# 1# t%e 7e,(eta(#ⵀGene(a/ &%en esta1/+s%+ng sa/a(# s,a/es fo(t%e A00/+,ant and t%e T(+1una/ +n Shaia UNDT/2013/096 %as ,onf+(med +ts ,om0eten,e to ,ons+de(t%e matte(›

1. T%e fo(me(Adm+n+st(at+-e T(+1una/ +n +ts Judgment No. 1100 Hasanat Schmoeltzer et al 32003ᴣ found +n ,onne,t+on &+t% a /o,a/ sa/a(# su(-e# +n V+enna t%at t%e manne(+n &%+,% t%e 6nte(nat+ona/ C+-+/ 7e(-+,e Comm+ss+on 3;6C7C=ᴣ met%odo/og# +s a00/+ed +s a -a/+d su1‹e,t fo(‹ud+,+a/ (e-+e&› +n +ts Judgment No. 90 Abdala et a/ 319934 and No. 6@0 Abdala et a/ 319944$ t%e fo(me(Adm+n+st(at+-e T(+1una/ fu(t%e(found t%at +t &as ,om0etent to (e-+e& sa/a(# and 1enef+t ,/a+ms of +nte(nat+ona//# (e,(u+ted Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e staff +n 57CCA. 6n t%e same -e+n$ t%e fo(me(Adm+n+st(at+-e T(+1una/ ,ons+de(ed +tse/f ,om0etent to e.am+ne a ,/a+m on 1e%a/f of a /a(ge num1e(of Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e staff o-e(t%e dete(ment of ,ost of /+-+ng ad‹ustments fo(Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e sa/a(# s,a/es +n se-en %ead9ua(te(s dut# stat+ons 3,f. Judgment No. 39 $ Oummih et a/ 319B@44›

,. 59ua//#$ t%e Adm+n+st(at+-e T(+1una/ of t%e 6nte(nat+ona/ Da1ou(!(gan+sat+on 3;6D!AT=ᴣ found +tse/f ,om0etent to ,ons+de(a00ea/s f(om staff o-e(t%e a00/+,at+on of 6C7C met%odo/og# to /o,a/ sa/a(# su(-e#s$ u0%o/d+ng t%e staff mem1e(sᴀ (+g%t fo(t%e fu// and fa+(a00/+,at+on of t%e 8/emm+ng 0(+n,+0/e 3Judgment No. 1@13 re oretta et al4. T%e 6D!AT found t%at s+n,e t%e a00/+,at+on of t%e met%odo/og# (e9u+(es some d+s,(et+on$ t%e T(+1una/ &as on/# ,om0etent to ,ons+de(an a1use of aut%o(+t# +n t%e e.e(,+se of su,% d+s,(et+on›

‹. T%e dua/ sa/a(# s,a/e a/so +m0a,ts t%e A00/+,ants +n t%at t%e# a(e 0a+d a /o&e(de0enden,# a//o&an,e fo(t%e+(de0endents 1o(n afte(1 " a(,% 2012 a,,o(d+ng to t%e se,onda(# sa/a(# s,a/e›

). T%e met%odo/og# does not 0(o-+de fo(a d+s0ute (eso/ut+on me,%an+sm +n ,ase of d+s0ute› un/ess a ne& ,om0(e%ens+-e su(-e# +s ,ondu,ted\$ t%e(e +s /+tt/e ,%an,e t%at t%e s+tuat+on &+// +m0(o-e›

/. 6n -+e& of t%e +m0o(tant 0o/+,# +m0/+,at+ons\$ t%e /a(ge num1e(of staff affe,ted and t%e ,onse9uen,es of t%e 0(esent s+tuat+on on t%e ‹o1 se,u(+t# and f+nan,+a/ &e// 1e+ng of /o,a/ staff\$ t%e A00/+,ants (e9uest an e.0ed+ted %ea(+ng of t%e ,ase› t%e# (e9uest t%e T(+1una/ to o(de(t%e +mmed+ate +n-a/+dat+on of t%e sa/a(# s,a/es (esu/t+ng f(om t%e 2011 su(-e# a

1.   !n t%e me(+ts$ t%e *es0ondent notes t%at t%e s,o0e of t%e T(+1una/⅄s (e-+e& +s /+m+ted$ s+n,e t%e 7e,(eta(#⅃Gene(a/ %as d+s,(et+on to f+. t%e sa/a(+es of staff mem1e(s$ and t%e T(+1una/ ,annot su1st+tute +ts ‹udgment to t%at of t%e 7e,(eta(#⅃Gene(a/. 6t +s /+m+ted to e.am+ne +f t%e de,+s+on &as

%.   T%e (e-+sed sa/a(# s,a/es fo(2ang)o)$ T%a+/and$ as 0(omu/gated on 6 8e1(ua(# 2012 (es0e,t t%e 8/emm+ng P(+n,+0/e$ &%+,% +m0/+es t%at t%e sa/a(+es %a-e to 1e among t%e 1est$ &+t%out 1e+ng t%e a1so/ute 1est$ at t%e dut# stat+on⟩ t%e (e-+sed sa/a(# s,a/es fo(2ang)o) (ema+n among t%e 1est of t%e /o,a/+t#⟩

+.   T%e a00/+,at+on s%ou/d 1e d+sm+ssed +n +ts ent+(et#.

29.   T%e A00/+,ants (e9uest t%e (es,+ss+on of t%e (esu/ts of t%e 2011

31.   The subject of the above-referenced decision is, on the one hand, the freeze of salary scales of staff members in the General Service and National Officers category recruited before 1 March 2012 and, on the other hand, the issuance of secondary salary scales for staff members in the General Service and National Officer category recruited on or after 1 March 2012.

32.   The scope of the Tribunal's jurisdiction is clearly determined and limited by its Statute, which provides in art. 2.1(a) that it is competent to hear and pass judgment on applications against administrative decisions alleged to be in non-compliance with the terms of appointments or the contract of employment. It follows that for an application to be receivable, the decision that is being challenged has to be an "administrative decision" under art. 2.1(a) of the Tribunal's Statute.

33.   The Tribunal considers that when the Appeals Tribunal has determined its

&+t%+n adm+n+st(at+-e /a& s#stems$ as implied adm+n+st(at+-e de,+s+ons.

!ssuance o" secondar# salar# scales "or sta"" recruited on or a"ter $ %arch & '$&

3 .   T%e de,+s+on to +ssue se,onda(# sa/a(# s,a/es fo(staff mem1e(s (e,(u+ted on o(afte(1 " a(,% 2012 ,/ea(/# does not amount to an adm+n+st(at+-e de,+s+on unde(a(t. 2.13a4 of t%e T(+1una/As 7tatute$ as 0e(t%e te(ms of t%e a1o-e⊞9uoted def+n+t+on ado0ted 1# t%e A00ea/s T(+1una/. At t%e moment of t%e+(+ssuan,e$ t%e se,onda(# sa/a(# s,a/es &e(e to a00/# e. ,/us+-e/# +n t%e futu(e$ fo(an undef+ned 0e(+od$ to a g(ou0 of 0e(sons &%+,% at t%at t+me and as at toda# ,ou/d and ,annot 1e +dent+f+ed. As su,%$ t%e +ssuan,e of se,onda(# sa/a(# s,a/es fo(Gene(a/ 7e(-+,e staff and Nat+ona/ !ff+,e(s (e,(u+ted on o(afte(1 " a(,% 2012 +s not of +nd+-+dua/ a00/+,at+on and does not 0(odu,e d+(e,t /ega/ ,onse9uen,es. 6t does ,onst+tute an adm+n+st(at+-e a,t &+t% (egu/ato(# 0o&e($ 1ut not an adm+n+st(at+-e de,+s+on as 0e(t%e a1o-e ,(+te(+a ado0ted 1# t%e A00ea/s T(+1una/. T%e(efo(e$ t%+s 0a(t of t%e a00/+,at+on +s not (e,e+-a1/e$ ratione materiae and %as to 1e d+sm+ssed.

(reeze o" existing salar# scales in e""ect since $ August & '$'

36.   T%e T(+1una/ no& %as to ,ons0(a)3.84766(,)3.84766(4(68(e)3.84766(a)3.84766(()3.00781(7(()3

        s6.68%e a and ,   t(1766( )-60(g%.36 - 20.76 T

staff mem1e(s &%o %ad 1een on st(+)e on t&o s0e,+f, da#s$ &ou/d 1e ,o-e(ed 1# a 0F 0a#(o// dedu,t+on f(om t%e ne.t 0a#(o// and a 0F dedu,t+on f(om annua/ /ea-e$ and t%at 100F 0a#(o// dedu,t+on &ou/d 1e made fo(a// staff &%o &e(e a1sent f(om &o() on anot%e(s0e,+f, da# I ,onst+tutes an a00ea/a1/e adm+n+st(at+-e de,+s+on. T%e A00ea/s T(+1una/ found t%at t%e C+(,u/a(,onta+ned ;a// t%e ne,essa(# ,om0onents (efe((ed to +n Andronov to g+-e (+se to /ega/ ,onse9uen,es fo(t%e st(+)+ng staff= and t%at ;+t ,onta+ned +nfo(mat+on &%+,% affe,ted t%e (+g%ts of t%e staff mem1e(s +n 9uest+on$ g+-en t%at +t &as 1e+ng ,/ea(/# ,ommun+,ated to t%e (e/e-ant staff mem1e(s t%at dedu,t+ons &e(e go+ng to 1e made f(om t%e+(sa/a(+es=$ %en,e$;-+sHLH-+s t%e st(+)+ng staff mem1e(s +t %ad +nd+-+dua/ a00/+,at+on=.

39. 6t +s t%e ,ons+de(ed -+e& of t%+s T(+1una/ t%at t%e s+tuat+on +n t%e ,ase at %and d+ffe(s f(om t%e ,ase of Al Surkhi et al. T%e C+(,u/a(+n Al Surkhi et al) &as add(essed and a00/+ed to a ,e(ta+n and ,/ea(/# def+na1/e g(ou0 of staff mem1e(s &%o %ad 1een on st(+)e on t&o o(t%(ee s0e,+f, da#s$ and &%o$ t%e(efo(e$ 1# t%e+(o&n ,on,(ete a,t+on$ &e(e su1<e,ted to a ,e(ta+n de,+s+on 1# t%e Adm+n+st(at+on I to &+t$ a dedu,t+on f(om 0a#(o///annua/ /ea-e on t%e 1as+s of t%e 0(+n,+0/e of no 0a# fo(da#s not &o()ed. T%us$ t%e de,+s+on$ t%oug% ,o//e,t+-e$ &as of +nd+-+dua/ a00/+,at+on$ and +ts a00/+,at+on &as ,/ea(/# def+ned +n s,o0e and t+me. 6n t%e 0(esent ,ase$ %o&e-e($ t%e sa/a(# f(eeGe a00/+es to a g(ou0 of staff mem1e(s def+ned e.,/us+-e/# 1# t%e+(status and ,atego(# &+t%+n t%e !(gan+Gat+on$ and$ as noted a1o-e$ +ts a00/+,at+on +n t+me and du(at+on ,annot 1e dete(m+ned. A,,o(d+ng/#$ t%e T(+1una/ ,on,/udes t%at +n a00/#+ng t%e test of Andronov$ t%e de,+s+on to f(eeGe e.+st+ng sa/a(# s,a/es unt+/ t%e ;ga0 +s ,/osed=$ as ,onta+ned +n !E*" ,a1/e of 6 8e1(ua(# 2012$ does not ,onst+tute an adm+n+st(at+-e de,+s+on fo(t%e 0u(0ose of a(t. 2.13a4 of t%e T(+1una/As 7tatute.

40. T%+s 0a(t of t%e a00/+,at+on +s t%e(efo(e e9ua//# not (e,e+-a1/e$ and %as to 1e d+sm+ssed.

41. "o(eo-e($ t%e T(+1una/ (e,a//s t%at de,+s+ons 1# &%+,% t%e 7e,(eta(#HGene(a/ f+.es sa/a(# s,a/es +n a,,o(dan,e &+t% t%e a1o-eH9uoted

0(o-+s+ons of t%e 7taff *egu/at+ons$ a(e measu(es &+t% (egu/ato(# 0o&e(&%+,% t%e T(+1una/ %as no ,om0eten,e to (es,+nd.

42.   6t +s on/# at t%e o,,as+on of +nd+-+dua/ a00/+,at+ons aga+nst t%e mont%/# sa/a(#/0a#s/+0 of a staff mem1e(t%at t%e /atte(ma# susta+n t%e +//ega/+t# of t%e de,+s+on 1# t%e 7e,(eta(#﹣Gene(a/ to f+. and a00/# a s0e,+f+, sa/a(# s,a/e to %+m/%e($ +n &%+,% ,ase t%e T(+1una/ ,ou/d e.am+ne t%e /ega/+t# of t%at sa/a(# s,a/e &+t%out (es,+nd+ng +t. As su,%$ t%e T(+1una/ ,onf+(ms +ts usua/ ‹u(+s0(uden,e a,,o(d+ng to &%+,%$ &%+/e +t ,an +n,+denta//# e.am+ne t%e /ega/+t# of de,+s+ons &+t% (egu/ato(# 0o&e($ +t does not %a-e t%e aut%o(+t# to (es,+nd su,% de,+s+ons.

43.   6n -+e& of t%e fo(ego+ng$ t%e T(+1una/ D5C6D57:

T%e a00/+,at+on +s (e‹e,ted.

Signed

Judge Jean﹣8(anço+s Cous+n

Dated t%+s   ᵗ% da# of "a(,% 2014

5nte(ed +n t%e *eg+ste(on t%+s   ᵗ% da# of "a(,% 2014

Signed

*enN ". Va(gas ".$ *eg+st(a($ Gene-a