## UNITED N

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/001 Judgment No. UNDT/2014/121

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/001

to <code>%ea\$so%\$ 8'e%9</code> \$eyond 61 De"em\$e% 2016. 4. +H. to sepa%ate 8'e%9 on 61 De"em\$e% 2016& pend!ng 8t'e9 GA de"!s!on. ). +H. t'at 8s'e9 8 / ou d9 'a3e no !en on a post / '! e on tempo%a%y ass!gnment / !t' 4:CT. ?. +H. to !n" ude t'e statement ,2/\* 'as no !en aga!nst Umo;a post- !n 8'e%9 8PA9 fo%m. =. +H. not to !nfo%m 8'e%9 / 'o !s a""ounta\$ e fo% \* 22 %esou%"es so t'at 8s'e9 1no / 8s9 / 'o 8s'e9 "an spea1 to a\$out 8'e%9 post-.

- 22. By ema! of 2? De"em\$e% 2016& t'e App!"ant p%o3!ded "omments to t'e ,Note fo% t'e f! e- of 24 De"em\$e% 2016& stat!ng& inter alia, t'at ,sepa%at!on- / as not ment!oned at t'e meet!ng. 2'e a so as1ed fo% fu%t'e% " a%!f!"at!ons "on"e%n!ng t'e de"!s!ons ta1en %ega%d!ng 'e% post.
- 26. By ema! of t'e same day&t'e Adm!n!st%at!3e 4ff!"e%& <4/D \* & !nfo%med t'e App!"ant t'at 4:CT 'ad %eBuested t'e e7tens!on of 'e% tempo%a%y ass!gnment fo% an add!t!ona pe%!od of t'%ee mont's t'%oug' 61 \* a%"' 2014. 2a!d ema! fu%t'e% stated t'e fo o / !ng +emp'as!s !n t'e o%!g!na .F

:n t'!s %ega%dk p ease note t'at to date t'e 8GA9 'as not made a de"!s!on %ega%d!ng t'e p%oposed a\$o !s'ment of you% post.

:n !g't of t'e a\$o3e and /'!e /e a/a!t t'e GAAs de"!s!on %ega%d!ng you% post& t'e t'%ee(mont' e7tens!on of t'e ass!gnment / ou d \$e \$ased on one of t'e fo o/!ng "ond!t!onsF

1. :f t'e 8GA9

- 24. By ema! of 2= De"em\$e% 2016& t'e App!"ant e7p%essed 'e% /o%%!es a\$out 'e% \$e!ng on a tempo%a%y ass!gnment /!t' 4:CT /!t'out 'a3!ng a !en aga!nst any post as of 1 Janua%y 2014& not!ng t'at 'ad s'e 1no/n t'at s'e /ou d not 'a3e a post /'! e on a tempo%a%y ass!gnment& s'e /ou d 'a3e fo"used mo%e on app y!ng fo% :nsp!%a ;o\$ open!ngs %at'e% t'an fo% tempo%a%y ;o\$ open!ngs. :n 'e% ema! & t'e App!"ant a so %eBuested some ass!stan"e fo% an ,e7"ept!ona p a"ement aga!nst anot'e% post& s'ou d 'e% post \$e a\$o !s'ed. :n t'e ema! s'e %e"e!3ed !n %ep y on t'e same day& t'e Adm!n!st%at!3e 4ff!"e%& <4/D \* & p%oposed to meet /!t' 'e% on 60 De"em\$e% 2016& \$ut t'e App!"ant %ep!ed t'at \$efo%e 'a3!ng su"' a meet!ng& s'e /ou d !1e to %e"e!3e "a%!f!"at!on a\$out / 'o made t'e de"!s!on to a\$o !s' \*22 posts to ensu%e t'at t'e de"!s!on(ma1e%+s. pa%t!"!pate at t'e meet!ng.
- 2). 4n t'e same day&

- 2>. 4n 1) Janually 2014 s'e aga!n f! ed a %eBuest fo% management e3a uat!on +\* < %eBuest No. 4. of t'e de"!s!ons ,1. +H. t'at 8s'e9 8 / ou d9 'a3e no !en on a post / '! e on tempo%ally ass!gnment / !t' 4:CT \$eyond 61 De"em\$e% 2016. 2. +H. not to ass!st 8'e%9 !n e7"ept!ona p a"ement aga!nst a post. 6. +H. not to !nfo%m 8'e%9 / 'o !s a""ounta\$ e fo% \* 22 %esou%"es +H.-. 2'e %e"e!3ed a %ep y dated 1? Janually 2014 k!n / '!"' t'e \* <U "on" uded t'at 'e% \* < %eBuest No. 4 / as not %e"e!3a\$ e.
- 60. By app !"at!on f! ed on 10 #e\$\uangle ua\u2014\u2
- 61. 4n 12 #e\$%ua%y 2014\(\text{t'e app !"at!on / as se\(\text{3}\)ed on t'e @espondent\(\text{t'o f! ed '!s \(\text{kep y on } 14 \* a\)\"' 2014.
- 62. 4n 4 \*a%"' 2014& t'e App!"ant /as !nfo\smed \\$y ema! f\som t'e Adm!n!st\sat!3e 4ff!"e\s <4/D \* & t'at 4:CT 'ad \seBuested t'e e7tens!on of 'e\s tempo\say ass!gnment fo\s an add!t!ona pe\s!od of t'\see mont's t'\soug' 60 June2014. T'e ema! spe"!f!"a y ment!oned t'at ,t'!s e7tens!on 8/ou d9 \\$e unde\s t'e same te\sms and "ond!t!ons as 8'e\s "u\s\end{array} "u\s\end{array} ent ass!gnment\s !.e. t'e\see 8/ou d9 \\$e no !en on a post !n \* 22 o\s any ot'e\s post !n \\$D \* 9 s!n"e 8'e\s 9 post !n \* 22 / as a\\$o !s'ed effe"t!3e 1 Janua\s y 2014-.
- 66. By 4%de% No. 10E + GVA/2014. of 1? Ju y 2014& t'e T%!\$una "on3o1ed t'e pa%t!es to an o%a 'ea%!ng& /'!"' /as 'e d on 4 2eptem\$e% 2014 \$y 3!deo"onfe%en"e. T'e App !"ant !nd!"ated at t'e 'ea%!ng t'at !n t'e meant!me 'e% "ont%a"t 'ad \$een e7tended unt! 61 De"em\$e% 2014 on 'e% "u\%ent tempo\%a\%y pos!t!on /!t'!n 4:CT.

o\de\notate to p\nesent 'e\notate post as 3a"ant \nesetate fo\nestate t'e ACABG and #!ft' Comm!ttee as pa\notate of t'e 6E pe\nestate pe\nestate and t'e 3a"ant posts as at 1 Janua\notate 2014 !n o\nestate to ;ust!fy a\notate o !s' ment of t'ose postsL

## On the merits

- e. 2'e 'ad %easona\$ e e7pe"tat!on to \$e !e3e\ \$ased on t'e engt'y "o\%esponden"e \$et / een t'e U2G/D \* and t'e D!\%e"to\% Umo;a\\ t'at \* 22 posts / ou d \%etu\%n to t'e 4ff!"e of t'e U2G/D \* fo o / !ng t'e "omp et!on of Umo;a\L
- f. T'e %eason g!3en \$y t'e <7e"ut!3e 4ff!"e% D\*  $\$  t'at 'e% post /ou d no onge% \$e ne"essa%y g!3en t'at Umo;a /as a %eady do!ng \$us!ness p%o"ess !mp%o3ement !s not suppo%ted \$y t'e fa"tsL
- g. :n A/?E/6=)& / '!"' /as t'e #!ft' p%og%ess %epo%t p%epa%ed on Umo;a s!n"e 200>& t'e%e /as no ment!on of t'e tempo%a%y !nteg%at!on of \* 22 staff !nto Umo;a anymo%e& e3en t'oug' \* 22 staff /e%e st! !nteg%ated /!t'!n Umo;a& / '! e t'e !ntent!on to "%eate a \$us!ness %e(eng!nee%!ng g%oup /as a %eady statedL t'!s !nd!"ates t'at t'e !ntent /as to %ep a"e \* 22 /!t' a ne/team pe%fo%m!ng t'e same fun"t!onsL fu%t'e%mo%e& no "ons!de%at!on /as g!3en to a"tua 3a"an"!es and p%o;e"ted %et!%ements / 'en !dent!fy!ng posts to \$e a\$o !s'ed. T'e fa"t t'at se3e%a 3a"an"y announ"ements 'ad \$een pu\$!s'ed!n 2016 to %e"%u!t t'%ee G2 staff /!t' Umo;a& t'oug' t'e%e seemed to \$e no fund!ng to "ont!nue 'e% post& s'o/s t'at t'e / 'o e p%o"edu%e ead!ng to t'e a\$o !s'ment of t'e \* 22 posts /as ta!nted \$y an !n'e%ent "onf!"t of !nte%est and& 'en"e& /as fa/edL
- '. T'e C'!ef& \* 22& / as not "onsu ted t'%oug'out t'e de"!s!on(ma1!ng p%o"ess. T'e Adm!n!st%at!on 'as \$een !ntent!ona y e3as!3e t'%oug'out t'e ent!%e p%o"ess to / a%ds t'e App !"ant& and desp!te 'e% nume%ous %eBuests& !t d!d not !nfo%m 'e% as to / 'o / as a""ounta\$ e fo% t'e \* 22 %esou%"esL
- !. 2'e /as not g!3en suff!"!ent not!"e of te\m!nat!on of 'e\"ont\a"t\\
  /'!"' \( \text{\texit{\text{\texi{\tex{\texi{\texi{\texi\texi{\texi\texi{\texi{\texi\texi{\texi{\texi}\

2016 / 'en s'e / as fa"ed / !t' t'e un"e\ta!nty su\taling 'e\taling 'e\taling "ont\taling" tua s!tuat!onL

- ;. T'e Adm!n!st%at!on t%eated 'e% /!t'out due "ons!de%at!on&!n pa%t!"u a% / 'en s'e d!d not get t'e ass!stan"e s'e 'ad %eBuested \$ased on se".11 of 2T/A:/2010/6 +2taff se e"t!on system.& / '!"' dea s /!t'-p a"ement aut 'o%!ty outs!de t'e no%ma p%o"ess-L
- T'e se%les of e3ents s'e "ontests& name y t'e den!a of a !en aga!nst a post !n D \* & t'e de"!s!on not to %ea\$so%\$ 'e% fo o/!ng t'e end of 'e% tempo%a%y ass!gnment& and t'e de"!s!on not to !nfo%m 'e% as to /'o !s a""ounta\$ e fo% \*22 %esou%"es so t'at s'e "ou d e7p o%e e7"ept!ona p a"ement aga!nst a post& demonst%ates t'at t'e de"!s!on to a\$o !s' t'e post s'e /as en"um\$e%!ng /as !ntended to deny 'e% t'e oppo%tun!ty fo% "ont!nued emp oyment /!t' t'e UN fo% /'!"' s'e /as e !g!\$ eLs'e a so /as not a\$ e to app y fo% t'e 0 oung P%ofess!ona s P%og%amme& s!n"e to \$e e !g!\$ e fo% !t staff mem\$e%s must 'o d an appo!ntment 3a !d fo% a m!n!mum of s!7 mont's& /'!"' /as not "ea% !n 'e% "ase due to 'e% un"e%ta!n "ont%a"tua s!tuat!onl.
- . 2'e %eBuests t'e %es"!ss!on of t'e !mpugned de"!s!ons and "ompensat!on fo% t'e d!st%ess& t'e 'a%m and damage "aused& !n" ud!ng t'e oss of ;o\$ se"u%!ty& t'e oss of "'an"e fo% "on3e%s!on to a "ont!nu!ng appo!ntment& and t'e oss of "a%ee% oppo%tun!t!es / !t'!n t'e UN. #!na y& s'e %eBuests t'at t'e T%!\$una o%de%s a %efe%%a of t'e matte% to t'e 2e"%eta%y(Gene%a fo% a""ounta\$! !ty pu%poses.
- 6). T'e @espondentAs p\!n"!pa "ontent!ons a\left\end{a}

## On receivability

a. T'e app !"at!on !s not %e"e!3a\$ e ratione materiae s!n"e t'e App !"ant does not "ontest adm!n!st%at!3e de"!s!ons unde% a%t. 2+1.+a. of t'e T%!\$una As 2tatutel.

\$. :ndeed& t'e T%!\$una does not 'a3e ;u%!sd!"t!on to %e3!e/ t'e GAAs de"!s!on to a\$o !s' t'e post en"um\$e%ed \$y t'e App !"antL mo%eo3e% su"' a de"!s!on 'ad no effe"t on t'e App !"antAs te%ms of appo!ntment as 'e% "ont%a"t 'ad \$een fu%t'e% %ene/edL fu%t'e% a staff mem\$e% does not 'a3e a %!g't to 'a3e '!s o% 'e% pos!t!on f!nan"ed \$y a pa%t!"u a% postL

".

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/001 Judgment No. UNDT/2014/121

- 6?. At t'e outset and !n 3!e / of t'e nume loss le Buests fo le management e3a uat!on f! ed \$y t'e App !"ant p\los to t'e f! !ng of 'e\los p\lesent app !"at!on t'e T\los !\los !\tau a needs to dete\los m!ne of / '!"' de"!s!ons !t 'as \los een du y se!5ed. :ndeed pu\los uant to t'e ;u\los !\tau sen de appeas T\los !\los uant !n Massabni 2012(UNAT(26EF)
  - 2. T'e dutles of a Judge p%lo% to talling a de"!slon !n" ude t'e adeBuate !nte%p%etat!on and "omp%e'ens!on of t'e app !"at!ons su\$m!tted \$y t'e pa%t!es& / 'ate3e% t'e!% names& / o%ds& st%u"tu%e o% "ontent t'ey ass!gn to t'em& as t'e ;udgment must ne"essa%! y %efe% to t'e s"ope of t'e pa%t!esA "ontent!ons. 4t'e%/!se& t'e de"!s!on(male% / ou d not \$e a\$ e to fo o / t'e "o%%e"t p%o"ess to a""omp !s' '!s o% 'e% tas1& ma1!ng up '!s o% 'e% m!nd and e a\$o%at!ng on a ;udgment mot!3ated !n %easons of fa"t and a / %e ated to t'e pa%t!esA su\$m!ss!ons.
  - 6. T'usk t'e aut'o%!ty to %ende% a ;udgment g!3es t

6>. 2!n"e t'e App !"ant e7p\( extrm{s} \) y "onf!\( \text{med} \) at t'e 'ea\( \text{!ng} \) t'at t'ose / e\( \text{e} \) t'e de"!s!ons s'e /!s'ed to "'a enge\( \text{t'e T}\\)!\( \text{s} \) una "ons!\( \text{de}\\) s t'at !t !s du y se!\( \text{5ed} \) on y of t'e f!\( \text{3e} \) de"!s!ons as !sted a\( \text{\$03e} \). :n 3!e / of t'e fa"t t'at t'e @espondent

\$ut "on" ude t'at !t 'as no ;ud!"!a po / e%s / !t' %espe"t to matte%s fa !ng / !t'!n t'e GAAs e7" us!3e %ea m . 2!n"e !t !s not / !t'!n !ts ;u%!sd!"t!on& t'!s T%!\$una 'as no aut'o%!ty to %e3!e / t'e de"!s!on !n Buest!on +fo% a s!m! a% app%oa"'& see %e"ent Judgments Smith UNDT/2014/0>>& 'eegan UNDT/2014/100& and Dagadu UNDT/2014/101..

Decision to se arate the A licant essective () December \*+)( and non, rene "al os her si-ed, term a ointment

4). T'e T%!\$una notes t'at at t'e date of t'!s ;udgement& t'e App!"ant !s st! !n t'e emp oyment of t'e 4%gan!5at!on. Ke% f!7ed(te%m appo!ntment 'as \$een e7tended f%om 1 Janua%y 2014 unt! 61 De"em\$e% 2014 and s'e 'as not \$een sepa%ated f%om t'e 4%gan!5at!on at any po!nt !n t!me. T'e%efo%e& t'ese "ontent!ons of t'e App!"ant a%e moot.

Decision not to assist the A licant in the e-ce tional lacement against a ost

4?. By e7p%ess!ng 'e% d!s"ontent o3e% t'e fa"t t'at s'e 'ad not \$een ass!sted \$y t'e Adm!n!st%at!on !n t'e p a"ement aga!nst anot'e% post fo o/!ng t'e a\$o !s'ment of t'e post s'e !n!t!a y en"um\$e%ed& t'e App !"ant !s !n fa"t %efes%!ng

t'e mean!ng of t'e 2taff @u es-. T'e%efo%ek t'e App

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/001 Judgment No. UNDT/2014/121

%eBuest t'e @espondent to d!s" ose do"uments / '!" ' a%e !%%e e3ant to !ts de"!s!on on t'e "ase.

)1. :n 3!e / of t'e fo%ego!ng& t'e T%!\$una D<C:D<2F

T'e app !"at!on !s %e;e"ted !n !ts ent!%ety.

+Signed.

Judge T'omas Da1e%

Dated t'!s 60<sup>t'</sup> day of 2eptem\$e% 2014

<ntelled !n t'e @eg!stell on t'!s 60t' day of 2eptem\$ell 2014

+Signed.

@enN \*. Va%gas \*.&@eg!st%a% Gene3a