





UN%G8 ,+s sele9t-on \*eBuest +n fa.ou\* of t>o of t,e \*e9ommended 9and+dates  
endo\*sed 7" t,e C ' C: one 0s. ). 2. and 0s. C. 2.

E.

13. The Tribunal's decision No. 51 of 30 October 2013 rejected the Applicant's motion and ordered the Respondent to disclose the documents concerning one of the selected paragraphs of the "estimated monthly workload standard of United Nations".



assessment of the ,+ing manage 7e9ause t,e A66!+9ant >as  
\*e9ommended fo\* t,e 6osts)

9. T,e A66!+9ant 7ea\*s t,e 7u\*den of 6\*o.+ng t,\*oug, 9!ea\* and  
9on.+n9+ng e.+den9e t,at ,e >as den+ed a fa+\* 9,an9e of 6\*omot+on)

d. T,e a+m of t,e >\*+tten test >as to s,o\*t!+st su99essfu! 9and+dates fo\* a  
9om6eten9"37ased +nte\*.+e>D s+n9e t,e A66!+9ant >as +nte\*.+e>ed t,e  
>\*+tten test d+d not 6\*e?ud+9e ,+m)

e. T,e t,\*ee e.a!uato\*s of t,e >\*+tten test s9o\*ed t,e tests +nde6endent!"  
and anon"mous!"D

f. A staff mem7e\* ,as no \*+g,t to 6\*omot+on and fa.ou\*a7!e 6e\*fo\*man9e  
\*e6o\*ts and sen+o\*+t" 9annot 7e 9ons+de\*ed as g+.+ng \*+se to an eC6e9tan9" of  
6\*omot+on)

g. T,e &e9\*eta\*"3Gene\*a! ,as 7\*oad d+s9\*et+on +n matte\*s of a66o+ntment  
and 6\*omot+on)

,.

66a\*ent=8 ds9\*m+nat+on8 fa!u\*e to g+. e a 6a\*t" fu!! and fa+\* 9ons+de\*at+on and +n t, e fa9e of +\*\*efuta7!e 6\*o9edu\*a! +\*\*egu!a\*+t+es :Majbri 20123UNAT3200=. #t +s not t, e T\*+7una!!s \*o!e to su7st+ute +ts o>n de9+s+on fo\* t, at of t, e &e9\*eta\*"3Gene\*a! :Abbassi 20113UNAT3110=.

## Issues

23. #n ,s a66!+9at+on8 t, e A66!+9ant \*a+sed matte\*s +n \*e!at+on to >o\*- 6!a9e ,a\*assment and a7use of aut, o\*t". T, e T\*+7una! +nfo\*med , +m at t, e ,ea\*+ng t, at su9, matte\*s >e\*e not 6\*o6e\*" 7efo\*e +t and t, at ,e s, ou!d fo!!o> t, e su+ta7!e 9, anne!s to add\*ess t, em. T, e A66!+9ant 9!a\*+f+ed t, at , +s \*es6e9t+. e a!!egat+ons >e\*e to 7e 9ons+de\*ed as 7a9-g\*ound +nfo\*mat+on on!". #n !+g, t of t, e a7o. e8 +n t, +s Judgment t, e a!!egat+ons of >o\*- 6!a9e ,a\*assment and a7use of aut, o\*t" \*a+sed 7" t, e A66!+9ant >+!! not 7e add\*essed.

2@. T, e +ssues +n t, +s 9ase fo\* dete\*m+nat+on 7" t, e T\*+7una! a\*e:

a. 1 , et, e\* one of t, e sele9ted 9and+dates fu!f+!!ed a!! t, e \*eBu+\*ements fo\* t, e ad. e\*t+sed 6osts) and

7. 1 , et, e\* t, e A66!+9ant \*e9e+. ed fu!! and fa+\* 9ons+de\*at+on du\*+ng t, e sele9t+on 6\*o9ess fo\* t, e ad. e\*t+sed 6osts.

## D+d one of t, e sele9ted 9and+dates fu!f+!! t, e \*eBu+\*ements fo\* t, e 9ontested 6ostI

25. #t +s !a\*ge!" 6a\*t of t, e A66!+9ant!!s 9ase t, at one of t, e sele9ted 9and+dates8 0 s. C. 2.8 d+d not fu!f+!! t, e >o\*- eC6e\*+en9e \*eBu+\*ement fo\* t, e 6osts. #t +s 9!ea\* t, at t, e sele9t+on of a 9and+date >, o does not meet t, e 6u7!+s, ed 9\*+te\*a fo\* a 6ost \*ende\*s t, e sele9t+on 6\*o9ess +\*\*egu!a\*.

26. T, e >o\*- eC6e\*+en9e \*eBu+\*ed fo\* t, e ad. e\*t+sed 6osts >as as fo!!o>s:

At least f+. e "ea\*s of t\*ans!at+on eC6e\*+en9e +n a 7\*oad \*ange of su7?e9ts dealt >+t, 7" t, e Un+ted Nat+ons :6o!+t+9a!8 so9+a!8 lega!8 e9onom+98 f+nan9+a!8 adm+n+st\*at+. e8 s9+ent+f+9 and te9, n+9a! =8 >+t, a \*e9ogn+Jed s6e9+a!+Jat+on +n a 6a\*t+9u!a\* su7stant+. e8 te9, n+9a! o\* adm+n+st\*at+. e a\*ea. P\*efe\*a7!" +n9!ud+ng t, \*ee "ea\*s >+t, +n t, e Un+ted Nat+ons and some eC6e\*+en9e of self3\*e. +s+on.

2E. The respondent provided the Tribunal with the following information: that the United Nations' 2006 "Policy of the Secretary-General" was used to address the additional costs and recommendations letter from the Applicant's previous employees.

2G. From the documents evidence, the Tribunal finds that as of the time of submission, the Applicant for the additional costs 0 s. C. 2. ,ad t, see "eas" 11 months and 1E days of the applicant - eC6e\*en9e at the United Nations.<sup>1</sup>

2 . In the P5P s, used to address the additional costs 0 s. C. 2. and dated that from 1 & 6tem7e\* 2005 to 30 June 200E s, e >as 6u\*su+ng ,e\* maste\*sH studies full-time >, the s, e >o\*-ed 6a\*t3t+me as a t\*ans!ato\* at a 6\*+.ate 9om6an" +n (e+?+ng f\*om 1 Ju!" 2005 to 30 June 200E s, e t\*ans!ated ;on a.e\*age 208000 >o\*ds 9ounted +n \$ng!+s, 6e\* mont, <.

30. A letter of recommendation dated 1 4e7\*ua\*" 200G from the Applicant's previous employee indicates that 0 s. C. 2. >o\*-ed as a 6a\*t3t+me t\*ans!ato\* at its 9om6an" as from Ju!" 2005 and that s, e ,ad t\*ans!ated ;some 308000 >o\*ds 6e\* mont, < >, the s, e >o\*-ed t, e\*e.

31. The respondent submitted that according to the 6\*og\*amme Budget for the 7+enn+um 1 031 18<sup>2</sup> a t\*ans!ato\*Hs >o\*-!oad at the United Nations +s 18650 >o\*ds 6e\* da" >, +9, t\*ans!ates to 3@8560 >o\*ds 6e\* mont,. ConseBuent!" 0 s. C. 2.Hs eC6e\*en9e of t\*ans!at+ng at least 208000 >o\*ds 6e\* mont, at t, e 6\*+.ate 9om6an" +n (e+?+ng on a 6a\*t3t+me 7as+s fo\* t>o "eas" amounted to 5E.GF of a t\*ans!ato\*Hs >o\*-!oad at the United Nations. 5 ' 0 & UN%G dete\*m+ned t, at t, +s 6e\*9entage >as eBu+.al+nt to one "ea\* and one mont, of the applicant >o\*-eC6e\*en9e.

32. The &en+o\* 5uman 'esou\*9es %ff+9e\* 5 ' 0 & UN%G test+fed that on!" 6\*ofess+ona! eC6e\*en9e ga+ned afte\* t, e f+\*st deg\*ee +s 9ons+de\*ed 7" t, e

<sup>1</sup> 2 Ju!" 200E to 2G & 6tem7e\* 200E 3 De9em7e\* 200E to 31 De9em7e\* 200E 13 June 200G to 3 4e7\*ua\*" 2012 :date on >, +9, s, e a66!+ed fo\* t, e 6os+t-on=.

<sup>2</sup> A/C.5/05/1 : 1 o\*-3!oad standa\*ds fo\* .a\*+ous 9atego\*es of 9onfe\*en9eKse\* .+9+ng staff +n9!ud+ng 9!e\*+9a! and t"6+ng staff and >o\*-3!oad stat+st+9s fo\* t, e .a\*+ous 9onfe\*en9e se\*.+9es +n t, e 1 G63 1 GE and 1 GG31 G 7+enn+ums= of 3 0 a\*9, 1 0.



%\*gan+Jat+on as \*e!e.ant >o\*- eC6e\*+en9e. &,e added t,at >,en a 9and+date +nd+9ates t,at ,e/s,e >o\*-ed 6a\*t3t+me8 t,en t,e tota! du\*at+on of em6!o"ment >ou!d 7e \*edu9ed 7" ,a!f and 9ons+de\*ed as \*e!e.ant eC6e\*+en9e to 7e att\*+7uted to t,e 9and+date. Add+ona!!"8 s,e test+fed t,at +n s+tuat+ons >,e\*e +t +s +nd+9ated t,at t,e staff mem7e\* >as stud"+ng >,+!e >o\*-+ng8 6\*ofess+ona! eC6e\*+en9e ga+ned +s 6a\*t+a!!" 9ounted +f deemed as \*e!e.ant 6\*ofess+ona! eC6e\*+en9e. 5 ' 0&& UN%G 9ounts t,+s eC6e\*+en9e and uses +ts d+s9\*et+on to dete\*m+ne >,at 6e\*9entage to a99o\*d +t.

33. T,+s met,od of 9a!9u!at+on +s a!so +n !+ne >+t, 6a\*ag\*a6, G of t,e ;Gu+de!+nes fo\* dete\*m+nat+on of !e.e! and ste6 on \*e9\*utment to t,e 6\*ofess+ona! 9atego\*" and a7o.e< :;t,e gu+de!+nes<= >,9, 6\*o.+des t,at ;>o\*- eC6e\*+en9e 9an 7e a9Bu+\*ed on a fu!!3t+me o\* 6a\*t3t+me 7as+s. 1 o\*- eC6e\*+en9e a9Bu+\*ed on a 6a\*t3t+me 7as+s +

ot6as- 0 .29dC [ 2 ( )- 1 0 . 1 5 2 5 (>) 1 .7

t+s- 0 .29 1 593 ( )- 1 6 0 .242 (9)3.5875 (+)-2.3329(7)- 0.735 288(") 19.7162 (8)- 0.2

1 as t, e A66!+9ant a99o\*ded fu!! and fa+\* 9ons-de\*at+on +n t, e se!e9t+on 6\*o9ess fo\*



