Case No.: UNDT/GVA/2014/08 /R1

UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

Introduction

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/083/R1 Judgment No. UNDT/2016/111

 $matte(\ to \ t^*e \ D\ s\#ute \ T(\ 'una\ o(\ (e\&ons\ de(at\ o \ 0so \ t^*at \ t^*e \ a\#\#\ \&at\ o \ ma" \ 'e \&ons\ de(ed \ 5\ t^* \ t^*e \ 'ene \ t \ o \ t^*e \ u\$\$ \ ; A82 \ (e\&o(d1.$

-. !" ; (de(No. 131 +GVA/2016. o 1- June 2016) t*e T(\$'una\$ o(de(ed t*e Res#ondent to \$e t*e ; A82 C\$osu(e Note '" 24 June 2016) and t*e A##\$\$\&ant to

Hearing

11. G\\$3en t*at t*e #(esent &ase 5 as (emanded '" t*e A##ea\\$ T(\\$'una\\$ s#e\\$ \\$\&a\\$" o(t*\\$ T(\\$'una\\$ to &ons\\$de(t*e ; A82

- 16. ; n June 2014) t*e A##\$\&ant sent an ema\\$ to t*e C*\e o \8n3est\gat\ons\; A\82) UN/PA) &om#\\$a\n\ng a'out a\\$eged *a(assment aga\nst *e(and unet*\&a\\$'e*a3\ou(''' 6 (s. 7.) and as>\ng o(an \n3est\gat\on \nto *e(&om#\\$a\nt.

and *a(assment 0Ed\hdF not a\\$\) 5\ht*\n t*e s\&o#e o #(o*\h'\hted \&ondu\&t and Ed\hdF not) #(\hma a\hat{he}) meet t*e (easona '\hat{he} t*(es*o\hd \hat{he}) d \hat{he}) o(m\hat{he}\hat{he}) o(m\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}) meet t*e (easona '\hat{he} t*(es*o\hd \hat{he}) d \hat{he}) o(m\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}) meet t*e (easona '\hat{he} t*(es*o\hd \hat{he}) d \hat{he}) o(m\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}) meet t*e (easona '\hat{he} t*(es*o\hd \hat{he}) d \hat{he}) o(m\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}\hat{he}) not) #(\hat{he}\hat{he

- 20. !" ema% o 16 2e#tem'e(2014) t*e A##%&ant 5as not% led t*at ; A82 5ou\$d not 'e \$aun&*\lambda an \lambda n3est\lambda gat\lambda on \lambda nto *e(0&om#\lambda \lambda nts o *a(assment) 'u\lambda \lambda \lambda a 'use o aut*o(\lambda t" aga\lambda nst 12 sta mem'e(s at P2!1) s\lambda \lambda e ; A82 *ad 0&on&\lambda uded \lambda ts #(e\lambda mha(" (e3\lambda 5 o t*e matte(and E*adF ound t*at a u\lambda \lambda n3est\lambda gat\lambda on E5 asF not 5 a((anted1) t*e(e o(e &ons\lambda c)\lambda nst\lambda e \lambda nst e matte(0&\lambda sosed1.
- 21. !" ema% o 20 2e#tem'e(2014) t*e A##\$%&ant su'm%tted a (e:uest of management e3a\$uatkon agaknst; A824s de&kskon not to \$aun&* an %n3est\gatkon %nto 6 (s. 7.4s 'e*a3\kou(. 2*e (e&e\k3ed a (e#\$" to *e((e:uest on 31; &to'e(2014 (om t*e CAe&ut\k3e D\k(e&to() UN/PA) '" 5*\k8* s*e 5as not\kappa ked t*at; A82 de&ks\kons 5e(e 0outs\kde t*e s&o#e o (e3\ked 5 '" UN/PA management1.

Parties' submissions

22. T*e A##\$\\&ant4s #(\\n\&\#a\\$\\&ontent\\ons a(e\)

- a. T*e (e usa\$ o ; A82 to \$aun&* t*e (e:uested \$n3est\gat\on \ss un ounded) as *e(&om#\sa\nt 5 as du\s" do\u00e4umented and t*e \u00e4m#(o\u00fc\u00e4e('e*a3\u00fc\u00e4ou(o 6 (s. 7. aga\u00e4nst *e(\u00e4s e3\u00e4dent 'ased on a\u00e4\u00e4t t*e #(oo s*e a\u00e4(ead" su'm\u00e4tted on man" o\u00e4\u00e4as\u00e4ons\u00e3 and
- '. Ge(&ase \s not 'e\ng t(eated se(\sus\" '" UN/PA) and *e(manage(s t(eated *e('ad\s" as 5 e\s)) \s\nstead o s*o 5 \s\ng *e(su\##o(t and \s\nteg(at\s\ng *e(\s\nto t*e P2! team.

a. T*e &ontested de&\s\on o ; A\s2 5 as ta>en \n &om#\\anke 5 \times \text{ts}

- '. T*e &*a\$\$enged adm\n\st(at\3e de&\s\on \s u(t*e(mo(e \sa5 u\s as \t 5 as ta>en \n \som#\s\an\e 5\t* t*e (e:u\(ements #(o3\)\ded o(\n t*e Po\s\s\c."\.\s\ondowname 1 \take \take
- &. 8n add\t\on to t\times a 'o3e) t\times A##\\and and d\times d\times a(ge t\times 'u(den o #(o3\ing t\times a s\times e su e(ed an" damage (om t\times \angle ontested de\all s\inon\times and
- d. Conse: uent\$") t*e Res#ondent as>s o(t*e a##\$%&at\on to 'e (e?e&ted.

Consideration

- 24. T*e A##ea\$s T(\(\)' una\(\) ound \(\)n \(\)ts Judgment Nielsen 2016,UNAT,64\(\)e t*at t*e D\(\)s#ute T(\(\)' una\(\) d\(\)d not eAe(\(\)\(\)kse su \(\)\(\)\(\)k\(\)hall s\(\) s\(\)(ut\(\)\(\)'\\\ n\(\)\(\) son\(\)\(\)\undersight not t*e A##\(\)\(\)\(\)kant4s \(\)\(\)om#a\(\)hall s \(\) as \(\)\(\) the A##ea\(\)s T(\(\)\'\ una\(\)\(\) *e\(\)d t*at\(\)
 - 8n e e&t) t*e D\s#ute T(\s'una\s4s Judgment (eads as a \s(st Instante assessment o t*e (etel3a'litt" o 6 s. Niessen4s a\(egat\) ons o \(*a(assment 5 *en t*e #(o#e(\) un\(et\) on o \(t*e UNDT \) s to ?ud%&%ass" (e3%e5 t*e de&%s%on o ; A82 5 *%&* %s mandated unde(t*e 2013 UN/PA Po\%" to &ondu&t su&* an assessment) #a(t\&u\\$a(\\$" \n &\(\&u\mstan\&es 5*e(e t*e(e 5 as a 5(\\tten (e\&o(d &a#a'se o 'esing dssssssssss to t*e UNDT. T*us) 5e a(e not sats sed \$ega\$ 'as\s \n t\end{a} a 'sen\end{a}e o t\end{a}e a o(esa\d do\end{a}umenta(" (e\end{a}o(d. A)) #e(usa\) o t^*e ; A\(\)2 5 (\)1tten (e\(\)6o(d 5 as t^*e a##(o#(\)1ate sta(t\)1ng #o\nt (om 5 \cdot\keta t\text{*e UNDT s\cdot\square} a3e &ommen&ed \text{\text{s} sega\square} and a&tua\$ (e3\$e5 to dete(m\$ne 5*et*e(; A824 &on&\$us\$on not to t(ligge(an lin3estligation *ad a #(o#e(legal 'asis. A&&o(dlings") 5e &annot 'e sat\s \ed t*at t*e UNDT Judgment a&&o(ds 5\times t*e (e:u)(ements o A(t)&Se 11+1. o t*e UNDT 2tatute. /o(t*e o(egoling (eason) 5e 5 list (emand the matter to the District to the District

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/083/R1 Judgment No. UNDT/2016/111

 $T(\ 'una\ so\ t*at\ t*e\ a\#\#\%\&at\ ma" 'e \&ons\ de(ed 5 \ t*\ t*e 'ene \ t o t*e u\$; A82 (e\&o(d. De \ ea3e \ t to t*e d\s&(et\ o n o t*e D\s \#ute T(\ 'una\ as to *o5 \ t 5 \ s*es to a\&\&ess t*e (e\ e3ant \ n o(mat\ o n.$

20. T*e Po%%" esta' \$\\$*es an \\$n o(ma\\$ and a o(ma\\$ #(o\&ess o(dea\\$\ng 5\\$t* \&om#\\$a\\$nts \\$\\$ed unde(\\$t +see se\&. 6 o t*e Po%%".. As to t*e o(ma\\$ #(o\&ess) se\&. 6.2 #(o\\$\dea\\$\deate t*at\\$\

28. D\%t* (ega(d to se\&. < +0/o(ma\% P(o\&ess1. o t*e Po\%\&") \%ts (e\%e3ant #a(ts o(t*e #(esent \&ase (ead as o\%o5s\)

- 34. 8n t*e %nstant &ase) %t *as 'een esta'\$\%*s*ed t*at ; A82 (e3\%=5ed t*e A##\$\%\&ant4s &om#\\$a\\nt aga\\nst 6 (s. 7.) as 5e\\$\ as t*e do&uments atta\&*ed t*e(eto. ; A82 \\n3est\\\gato(s a\\$so &onta\&\ted t*e A##\\\&ant '" #*one on 10 2e\#tem'e(2014 to get u(t*e(\\nt n o(mat\\no and \&\\$a(\) \\\&at\\no ns \\no (es\#e\&\to *e(\&\no m\#\\angle a\no h).
- 3-. 8n %ts #(e\m\na(" assessment) ; A82 &on&\suded as o\$\sigma 5 sH

/(om ; A824 (e3%e5 o Et*e A##\$%&antF4s e\g*t \nd\%3\dua\ &om#\\$a\nts o 'u\\$\"\ng and *a(assment aga\nst *e(o(me(P2 ! &o\\$eagues and t*e su##o(t\ng \n o(mat\no s*e #(o3\)ded) ; A82 ound t*at Et*e A##\\$\&antF4s #(\ma(" &on\&e(n 5\)as t*e \\$a\&> o

- 3@. T*e same *o\$ds t(ue o(t*e A##\$\&ant4s a\$\egat\ons \n (es#e&t o d\s&(\m\nato(" (ema(>s made '" 6 (s. 7. T*e &om#\s\nt me(e\s" states t*at 6 (s. 7. 0Ed\s&ussedF nat\ona\\text{min} t\text{ toget}*e(5 \text{ t* ot*e} (team mem'e(s +\nk\s\utert\unedta\utert\utert\utert\utert\utert\utert\utert\utert\unedta\utert\ute
- 3<. T*e T(%'una% %nds t*at; A82 #(o#e(\$" eAe(&\sed \ts d\s&(et\on \n &on&\underline{\text{ud\ng}} t*at t*e A##\s\&\underline{\text{ant4s}} a\s\underline{\text{egat\nonsaga\nst}} 6 (s. 7. 5e(e \text{\text{nsu}} \text{\text{\text{\text{went}}} to a\s\underline{\text{5\text{\text{\text{\text{\text{se}}}}} ft*\underline{\text{

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2014/083/R1 Judgment No. UNDT/2016/111

Conclusion

41. 8n 3%e5 o t*e o(ego%ng) t*e T(<math>%'una\$ DCC\$DC2%

T*e a##\$%&at%on %s (e?e&ted %n %ts ent%(et".

+Signed.

Judge Te(esa!(a3o

Dated t*\s 1<\text{** da" o August 2016}

Cnte(ed \(\text{n} \) t*e Reg\(\text{ste}(\) on t*\(\text{s} \) 1<\(\text{t*} \) da" o August 2016 +Signed.

RenK 6. Va(gas 6.) Reg\st(a() Gene3a