Introduction

1. "n 16 Ju#$ 2015% t&e A''#()ant% *&o *o+,ed o+ t&e Un(ted Nat(ons " ()e o+ P+o-e)t .e+/()es 01UN"P.23% (#ed an a''#()at(on)ontest(ng t&e te+m(nat(on o &(s em'#o$ment *(t& one mont&4s)om'ensat(on (n #(eu o not()e.

2. T&e 5es'ondent (#ed &(s +e'#$ on 21 August 2015.

Facts

!. T&e A''#()ant (s a o+me+ 6n o+mat(on and Commun()at(ons Te)&no#og$ .e)u+(t$ " ()e+ 0P7!3 o UN"P. (n Va#en)(a% .'a(n% *&o% a#t&oug& em'#o$ed unde+ a UN"P.)ont+a)t% o'e+at(ona##$ *o+,ed o+ t&e Un(ted Nat(ons De'a+tment o+ 8(e#d .e+/()es.

4. 6n ea+#$ 9a$ 2012% t&e A''#()ant4s *(e% 9s. P.%)onta)ted a C#(n() (n Tun(s% s'e)(a#(s(ng (n '#ast() su+ge+$% (nd()at(ng t&at s&e *as see,(ng #('osu)t(on% :oto; to &e+ a)e and)o++e)t(/e a:dom(na# '#ast() su+ge+$. .&e a#so +e<uested &e#' +ega+d(ng &e+ na/e#% *&()& *as st(## see'(ng due to a '+e/(ous a:dom(no'#ast$. A te+ some e;)&anges *(t& t&e D(+e)to+ o % on 14 9a$ 2012 t&e A''#()ant4s *(e (n<u(+ed :$ ema(# a:out t&e eas(:(#(t$ o)ondu)t(ng #('osu)t(on on se/e+a# 'a+ts o &e+ :od$% stat(ng t&at s&e *anted t+eatment to &e+ a+ms% :a),% &('s% stoma)& and t&(g&s% as *e## as teet& *&(ten(ng and :oto; (n-e)t(ons to &e+ a)e. 6n &e+ ema(#% s&e a#so ment(oned t&at s&e &ad t+(ed to get t&e +e'o+t o t&e su+ge+$ 'e+ o+med ea+#(e+ :$ anot&e+ C#(n())a##ed % :ut t&at t&(s &ad :een unsu))ess u#. 8o##o*(ng u+t&e+ e;)&anges t&e A''#()ant4s *(e *ent to Tun(s on 21 9a$ 2012% and unde+*ent su+ge+$ on t&at date. T&e '+o)edu+es s&e unde+*ent (n)#uded t+eatment)ont+a)ted /(a and an um:(#()o'#ast$:$ a 9ed()a# Do)to+ +om anot&e+ C#(n()% .

5. A te+ su+ge+$% t&e A''#()ant4s *(e sta$ed o+ t*o n(g&ts at C#(n() % (n a s(ng#e +oom% and ou+ n(g&ts at t&e (/e sta+ Ca+t&age T&a#asso 5eso+t.

6.

T&e *(tnesses *e+e not as,ed to g(/e s*o+n test(mon$ no+ *e+e t&e$ as,ed to s(gn an$ *+(tten +e'o+t o t&e(+ test(mon$. .u)& a s&o+t)om(ng (n t&e (n/est(gat(/e '+o)ess ma$ *e##% (n ot&e+)(+)umstan)es% g(/e +(se to <uest(ons :e(ng +a(sed a:out t&e (nteg+(t$ o t&e (n/est(gat(on% 'a+t()u#a+#$ g(/en t&e 'otent(a##$ se+(ous)onse<uen)es o+ t&e sta mem:e+. =o*e/e+% t&e (nte+/(e*s *e+e +e)o+ded and t&e+e *as a s(gn(()ant deg+ee o)ons(sten)$ and)o++o:o+at(on (n t&e a))ounts g(/en :$ t&e *(tnesses and t&e do)uments '+odu)ed (n t&e)ou+se o t&e (n/est(gat(on.

11. @$ #ette+ dated 14 9 a+)& 2014 % t&e A''#()ant *as (n o+med :$ t&e D(+e)to+% 6A6G% t&at &e *as)ons(de+ed t&e su:-e)t o an (n/est(gat(on (nto a##egat(ons o med()a# +aud. 6A6G atta)&ed a)o'$ o Van:+eda4s +e'o+t% a#ong *(t& t&e

and +e#ated '+o)edu+e. 8u+t&e+% t&e Ca+t&age T&a#asso 5eso+t)on (+med to t&e (n/est(gato+s t&at

1?. @$ ema(# dated 1? 9 a+)& 2015 +om t&e Bega# .'e)(a#(st% UN"P.% t&e A''#()ant *as +e<uested to '+o/(de &(s)omments on t&e 6A6G +e'o+t *(t&(n ten *o+,(ng da$s. "n 24 9 a+)& 2015% t&e A''#()ant sent &(s)omments.

18. @$ ema(# o 16 A'+(# 2015% t&e A''#()ant +e)e(/ed a)&a+ge #ette+ dated 15 A'+(# 2015% s(gned on :e&a# o t&e De'ut$ >;e)ut(/e D(+e)to+% UN"P.% +e<uest(ng t&e A''#()ant to su:m(t)omments. T&e #ette+ a#so noted t&at 'u+suant to 'a+a. 96 o "+gan(Cat(ona# D(+e)t(/e 01"D23 No. !6% t&e A''#()ant &ad a +(g&t to)ounse# to ass(st &(m% and stated t&at an$ su)&)ounse# *ou#d :e at t&e A''#()ant4s o*n e;'ense.

19. @$ ema(# dated !0 A'+(# 2015 (n +es'onse to t&e)&a+ge #ette+% t&e A''#()ant stated:

> A#t&oug& 6 *as not a:#e to '+o/(de mu)& e/(den)e to su''o+t ou+ test(mon(es% (n t&e end 6 &a/e su:m(tted t&e)#a(m and t&e su''o+t(ng do)umentat(on t&at a+e not +e'+esentat(/e o t&e se+/()es m$ *(e +e)e(/ed. And t&e a)t t&at 6 &a/e not :een d(#(gent enoug& to)a+e u##$ '+e'a+e t&e)#a(m and +e/(e* t&e su''o+t(ng do)umentat(on (s not an e;)use. T&e+e o+e% t&e)&a+ges 6 am a)(ng a+e unde+standa:#e and a(+. 6 am t+u#$ so++$ (m$ a)t(ons &a/e)aused an$ +e'utat(ona# damages to UN"P..

20. @$ #ette+ dated 5 June 2015% s(gned :$ t&e Bega# .'e)(a#(st% UN"P.% on :e&a# o t&e De'ut$ >;e)ut(/e D(+e)to+% and de#(/e+ed to t&e A''#()ant on 8 June 2015% t&e A''#()ant *as (n o+med t&at &(s a'

:. .(n)e &e *as not su+e t&at #('o (##(ng *ou#d :e)o/e+ed and (n a))o+dan)e *(t& 'age 1? o t&e 9ed()a#% =os'(ta# and Denta# P#an% &e d(d not s'e)(()a##$ ment(on #('o (##(ng on t&e)#a(m% s(n)e t&e (ntent(on *as to

).

. T&e D(+e)to+ o a#so)on (+med t&at t&e (n/o()e su:m(tted :$ t&e A''#()ant)on)e+n(ng t+eatment at C#(n() d(d not)o++es'ond to t&e)o'$ s&e &ad o:ta(ned +om t&e C#(n() o+ t&e

A''#()ant4s +e<uest o+ d(s)#osu+e o do)uments *as g+anted% and &e *as g(/en t&e o''o+tun(t$ to (#e)omments on t&e add(t(ona# do)uments (#ed :$ t&e 5es'ondent. @ot& 'a+t(es *e+e a#so g(/en t&e o''o+tun(t$ to (#e)#os(ng su:m(ss(ons.

!1. =a/(ng +e/(e*ed t&e *&o#e)ase (#e% t&e T+(:una# (s sat(s (ed t&at on t&e :as(s o t&e *+(tten su:m(ss(ons and t&e am'#e do)umenta+$ e/(den)e on (#e% t&e+e (s no need o+ a &ea+(ng.

!2. 6t (s 'a+t o t&e A''#()ant4s)#a(m t&at t&e den(a# o med()a# and denta# (nsu+an)e)o/e+age du+(ng t&e t&(+t$ da$s o)om'ensat(on (n #(eu o not()e *as un#a* u#. .(n)e t&e A''#()ant a(#ed to see, management e/a#uat(on o t&at de)(s(on% (t (s not +e)e(/a:#e% 0 20147UNAT74023.

!!. A+t()#e I o t&e Un(ted Nat(ons .ta 5egu#at(ons '+o/(des (n +egu#at(on 10.10a3 t&at 1t&e .e)+eta+$7Gene+a# ma$ (m'ose d(s)('#(na+$ measu+es on sta mem:e+s *&o engage (n m(s)ondu)t2.

!4. .ta os(#at(0221(t)0.874347(&) 9 .6 9 .10a3 sttes t&ata0] T J 7 9 .23814 -3056 T d D [8.(#u+e

.ta

!6.

(nd t&e (m'ugned adm(n(st+at(/e de)(s(on to :e un+easona:#e% un a(+% (##ega#% (++at(ona#% '+o)edu+a##$ (n)o++e)t% o+ d(s'+o'o+t(onate. Du+(ng t&(s '+o)ess t&e D(s'ute T+(:una# (s not)ondu)t(ng a me+(t7:ased +e/(e*% :ut a -ud()(a# +e/(e*. Jud()(a# +e/(e* (s mo+e)on)e+ned *(t& e;am(n(ng &o* t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+ +ea)&ed t&e (m'ugned de)(s(on and not t&e me+(ts o t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+4s de)(s(on. T&(s '+o)ess ma$ g(/e an (m'+ess(on to a #a$ 'e+son t&at t&e T+(:una# &as a)ted as an a''e##ate aut&o+(t$ o/e+ t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+4s adm(n(st+at(/e de)(s(on. T&(s (s a m(sunde+stand(ng o t&e de#()ate tas, o)ondu)t(ng a -ud()(a# +e/(e* :e)ause due de e+en)e (s a#*a$s s&o*n to t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+% *&o (n t&(s)ase (s t&e .e)+eta+$7Gene+a#.

41. 6n 20127UNAT720? 0'a+a. 283 t&e A''ea#s T+(:una# &e#d t&at (n a s$stem o adm(n(st+at(on o -ust()e go/e+ned :$ #a*% t&e '+esum't(on o (nno)en)e &as to :e +es'e)ted% and t&at 1G)Honse<uent#$% t&e Adm(n(st+at(on :ea+s t&e :u+den o esta:#(s&(ng t&at t&e a##eged m(s)ondu)t o+ *&()& a d(s)('#(na+$ measu+e &as :een ta,en aga(nst a sta mem:e+ o))u++ed2.

42. F(t& +es'e)t to t&e standa+d o '+oo a''#$(ng (n d(s)('#(na+$)ases% t&e A''ea#s T+(:una# &e#d (n (ts Judgment 20117UNAT7164 t&atA

!0. D(s)('#(na+$)ases a+e not)+(m(na#. B(:e+t$ (s not at sta,e. @ut *&en te+m(nat(on m(g&t :e t&e +esu#t% *e s&ou#d +e<u(+e su ()(ent '+oo . Fe &o#d t&at% *&en te+m(nat(on (s a 'oss(:#e out)ome% m(s)ondu)t must :e esta:#(s&ed :$)#ea+ and)on/(n)(ng e/(den)e. C#ea+ and)on/(n)(ng '+oo +e<u(+es mo+e t&an a '+e'onde+an)e o t&e e/(den)e :ut #ess t&an '+oo :e$ond a +easona:#e dou:t K (t means t&at t&e t+ut& o t&e a)ts asse+ted (s &(g&#$ '+o:a:#e.

4!. 6n a''#$(ng t&e test set out (n % t&e T+(:una# *(## (+st e;am(ne *&et&e+ t&e '+o)edu+a# +e<u(+ements o "D No. !6 0UN"P. Bega# 8+ame*o+, o+ add+ess(ng non7)om'#(an)e *(t& UN standa+ds o)ondu)t3 *e+e o##o*ed.

44. T&e (n/est(gat(on *as (n(t(ated on t&e :as(s o)on)e+ns +ega+d(ng t&e)#a(m (#ed :$ t&e A''#()ant on 25 Ju#$ 2012% and a te+ Van:+eda &ad)onta)ted C#(n() o:ta(n(ng)on (+mat(on t&at t&e)#(n())ou#d not aut&ent()ate t&e (n/o()e su:m(tted :$ t&e A''#()ant 0(n/o()e No. 12008863% and t&at% (n t&e(+ /(e*% (t *as a a,e do)ument. 8u+t&e+% D+. D.% t&e su+geon)on)e+ned% stated :$ ema(# o

5?. >/en (one *e+e to :e#(e/e t&at (t *as on#$ u'on +e)e('t o t&e)&a+ge #ette+ t&at t&e A''#()ant +ea#(Ced t&at a su:stant(a# 'o+t(on o &(s)#a(m *as 4s)omm(ss(on +at&e+ t&an med()a# ees o+ &(s *(e4s o'e+at(on% t&e a)t o t&e matte+ (s t&at (n &(s)#a(m to Van:+eda &e d(d not ma,e an$ +e e+en)e to t&e t+eatment t&at

d(s)('#(na+$ measu+e (m'osed on a sta mem:e+ :e '+o'o+t(onate to t&e g+a/(t$ o &(s o+ &e+ m(s)ondu)t.

68. T&e +e)ent '+a)t()e o t&e .e)+eta+$7Gene+a# (nd()ates t&at se'a+at(on +om se+/()e% *(t&)om'ensat(on (n #(eu o not()e and *(t&out te+m(nat(on (ndemn(t$% (s)ons(de+ed a '+o'o+t(onate san)t(on (n)ases o su:m(ss(on o (nsu+an)e)#a(ms t&at)onta(ned a#se (n o+mat(on 0.T/6C/2016/263.

69. T&e T+(:una# does not (nd t&at t&e+e a+e an$ m(t(gat(ng)(+)umstan)es (n t&e