

UNITED N

Introduction

1. The T+i4!#al is sei;ed of 8& a : :licatio#s +elated to a challe#ge agai#st the +es!It of the co " :+ehe#si,e sala+* scale s!+,e* fo+ local staff i# I#dia# co#d!cted i# !#e %&1(. The a : :licatio#s i# ,ol ,e the U#ited Natio#s Sec+eta+iat# the Office of the U#ited Natio#s 3 igh Co " " issio#e+ fo+ Ref!gees# the U#ited Natio#s E#tit* fo+ -e#de+ E<!alit* a#d the E " :o8e+ " e#t fo+ 7 o " e#s a#d th+ee U#ited Natio#s 2!#ds a#d P+og+a " " es =the U#ited Natio#s De,elo: " e#t P+og+a " # the U#ited Natio#s Po: !latio# 2!#d =>UN2PA?@ a#d the U#ited Natio#s Child+e#As 2!#d@.

%. This 9!dg " e#t co#ce+#s %& a : :licatio#s +elated to %& A : :lica#ts 4ased i# Ne8 Delhi 8o+Bi#g fo+ UN2PA.

acts

(. The %&1(Co " :+ehe#si,e Sala+* Scale S!+,e* fo+ local staff 4ased i# I#dia =>%&1(I#dia Sala+* S!+,e*?@ 8as co#d!cted :!+s!a#t to the " ethodolog* ado:ted 4* the I#te+#atio#al Ci,il Se+,ice Co " " issio# =>ICSC?@ =see ICSC\$C%\$R.11# Re,ie8 of the " ethodolog* fo+ s!+,e*s of the 4est :+e,aili#g co#ditio#s of e " :lo* " e#t at d!t* statio#s othe+ tha# head<!a+te+s a#d si " ila+ d!t* statio#s s!+,e* " ethodolog* II@ a#d the) a#!al fo+ the co#d!ct of s!+,e*s of the 4est :+e,aili#g co#ditio#s of e " :lo* " e#t at d!t* statio#s othe+ tha# 3ead<!a+te+s a#d si " ila+ d!t* statio#s D " ethodolog* II.

E. As :e+ the a4o,e " ethodolog* a#d a.t. II of the)e " o+a#d!" of U#de+sta#di#g =>) OU?@ 4et8ee# the U#ited Natio#s a#d the 7 o+ld 3ealth O+ga#i;atio# => 7 3O?@ fo+ %&1%1%&1(5 7 3O 8as desig#ated to co#ti#le to act as +es:o#si4le age#c* fo+ the coo+di#atio# of the local sala+* scale s!+,e* i# Ne8 Delhi# I#dia. The+efo+e# 7 3O had the o,e+all +es:o#si4ilit* fo+ the s!+,e*s i#cl!di#g the a : :oi#t " e#t of the sala+* s!+,e* s:ecialists.

=BBB@ Re,ised allo8a#ces i# R!:ees #et :e+ a##!" a+e as
follo8s:

=1@ Child5 :e+ child5 s!49ect to " aKi " ! " of siK child+e#

- a. % (5F11 a: :lica4le to staff " e " 4e+s fo+ 8 ho " the
allo8a#ce 4eco " es :a*a4le o# o+ afte+ o#e
No,e " 4e+ %&1EL
- 4. %C51FG a: :lica4le to staff " e " 4e+s fo+ 8 ho " the
allo8a#ce 4eco " es :a*a4le :+io+ to o#e
No,e " 4e+ %&1EL

=%@ 2i+st la#g!age

- a. % '5F(% a: :lica4le to staff " e " 4e+s fo+ 8 ho " the
allo8a#ce 4eco " es :a*a4le o# o+ afte+ o#e
No,e " 4e+ %&1EL
- 4. (E51&E a: :lica4le to staff " e " 4e+s fo+ 8 ho " the
allo8a#ce 4eco " es :a*a4le :+io+ to o#e
No,e " 4e+ %&1EL

=(@ Seco#d la#g!age

- a. 1E5CGG a: :lica4le to staff " e " 4e+s fo+ 8 ho " the
allo8a#ce 4eco " es :a*a4le o# o+ afte+ o#e
No,e " 4e+ %&1EL
- 4. 1C5&F% a: :lica4le to staff " e " 4e+s fo+ 8 ho " the
allo8a#ce 4eco " es :a*a4le :+io+ to o#e
No,e " 4e+ %&1E.

!rocedural "istory

1&. The A: :lica#ts filed i#di, id!al "otio#s fo+ eKte#sio# of ti"e to file

a: :licatio#s 4efo+e the Dis: !te T+i4!#al to challe#ge the +es!It of the %&1(I#dia

Sala+* S1+,e1() = 69. 7 6 8 7 3 0 4 6 (i) 11. 3: 6 0 2 2 1 (r) 9. 7 8 4 3 6 (r) 2 2 1 (o) 7 2 0 9 6 0 0 F&U [(4c

eKisti#g sala+* scales a#d to +e, ie8 allo8a#ces do8#8a+d did #ot co#stit!te a# ad" i#ist+ati,e decisio# fo+ the :!+:ose of a+t. %.1=a@ of the T+i4!#alAs Stat!te. O!t of the (1 A::lica#ts i#,ol,ed5 %G a::ealed 4efo+e the U#ited Natio#s A::eals T+i4!#al.

1%. B* !dg " e#t Prasad et al. %&1G1UNATIG% '5 the A::eals T+i4!#al fo!#d that this T+i4!#al had >eKceeded its co" :ete#ce a#d 9!+isdictio# a#d co" " itted e++o+s i# :+oced!+e 8he# it dete+ " i#ed that the +e<!ests fo+ a# eKte#sio# of ti " e 8e+e the >e<!i,ale#t? of a: :licatio#s?. The A::eals T+i4!#al the+efo+e +e, e+sed the UNDT !dg " e#t a#d +e " a#ded all %G cases to this T+i4!#al5 8ith di+ectio#s to :e+ " it the A: :lica#ts to file thei+ a: :licatio#s. The A::eals T+i4!#al also +e " a#ded a#othe+ C% si " ila+ cases to the Dis: !te T+i4!#al.%

Cases No. See attached list

!dg " e#t No. UNDT\$%&1 '\$&' '

1G. I# a#tici:atio# of the co " :leKit* of the iss!es to 4e add+essed5 a#d 4ea+i#g i# " i#d that all a : :lica#ts 8hose cases had 4ee# +e " a#ded 8e+e self1+e:+ese#ted5 the T+i4!#al i#st+!cted its -e#e,a Regist+* to co#tact the Office of Staff Legal Assista#ce =>OSLA?@ a#d +e<!est that it +each o!t to all a : :lica#ts to assess 8hethe+ it co!ld :+o,ide legal +e:+ese#tatio# i# the :+oceedi#gs. OSLA co#fi+ " ed that it 8o!ld taBe #ecessa+* actio# i# this +es:ect.

1C. B* O+de+ No. 11E =- / A\$%&1C@ of 1C) a* %&1C5 the T+i4!#al5 inter alia5

Cases No.

See attached list

Cases No. See attached list

!dg " e#t No. UNDT\$%&1 '\$&' '

B. The Res:o#de#tAs co#te#tio# that the A::lica#ts o!ght to ha,e
challe#ged the " o#thl* sala+* :a*sli:s " !st 4e dis" issued inter alia since
the* do #ot co#tai# o+ e, e# eK:licitl* +efe+ to the i " : !g#ed decisio# O 8hat
is challe#ged i# this case is the sala+* f+ee;e# #ot the a " o!#t of +e " !#e+atio#L

c. The A: :eals T+i4!#al has held that a4se#t >a dete+ " i#atio# 4* the Sec+eta+*1 - e#e+al that a s:cific decisio#l " aBi#g 4od* is a tech#ical 4od*5 the eKe " :tio# f+o " M a " a#age " e#t e, al!atio# +e<!est !#de+ HsItaff H+I!le 11.%=4@ does #ot a: :l*? =see Faust %&1G1UNATIG'F =:a+a. ('@ a#d %ehr %&1E1UNATIEC' =:a+as. %F1%G@L

d. The A: :lica#ts ca##ot +easo#a4l* +el* !:o# the <!oted :ositio# of the UN Sec+eta+iatAs) a#age " e#t E, al!atio# U#it =>UN) EU?@5 i# Tintukasiri et al. i# s!: :o+ of thei+ #ot +e<!esti#g " a#age " e#t e, al!atio#. 2i+st5 the UN) EU has a disc+ete delegatio# of a!tho+it* f+o " the Sec+eta+*1 - e#e+al5 8hich does #ot i#cl!de the desig#atio# of tech#ical 4odies. Additio#all*5 the UN) EUAs o:io#s a+e #ot 4i#di#g o# the se:a+atel* ad " i#iste+ed 2!#ds a#d P+og+a " " es a#d othe+ UN E#ities 8ho co#d!ct thei+ o8# " a#age " e#t e, al!atio#. Seco#d5 the Tintukasiri et al. !dg " e#t cites a#othe+ UNDT decisio# =

Cases No. See attached list
!dg " e#t No. UNDT\$%&1 '\$& ' '

Consideration

%G. The iss!e of a# a: :licatio#As +ecei ,a4ilit* is a "atte+ of la8 that " a* 4e

Cases No. See attached list

!dg " e#t No. UNDT\$%&1 '\$& ' '

Cases No. See attached list

!dg " e#t No. UNDT\$%&1 '\$&' '

(C. The case at ha#d is #ot of a disci: li#a+* #at!+e# lea, i#g the T+i4!#al to assess
8hethe+ the co#tested decisio#5 taBe# !:o# the ad,ice of the LSSC a#d Sala+*
S!+,e* s:ecialists5 8as taBe# !:o# the ad,ice of a tech#ical 4od*. Rele,a#tl*5 staff
+!le 11.%=4@ does #ot :+o,ide fo+ a :a+tic!la+ 8a*5

Cases No. See attached list
!dg " e#t No. UNDT\$%&1 '\$& ' '

E%.

F8. This A : : lica#tAs a : : licatio# is ide#tical to the o#es of those +e : +ese#ted 4* OSLA. I# the i#te+est of 9!stices OSLAAs a-g! " e#ts co#ce+#i#g +ecei ,a4ilit* of the a : : licatio#s 8e+e co#side+ed 8ith +es:ect to this self1+e : +ese#ted A : : lica#t 8ho did #ot a ,ail hi " self of the o : : o+t!#it* to eithe+ " aBe additio#al s!4 " issio#s i# this +es:ect a#d\$o+ to a : : ea+ 4efo+e the T+i4!#al at the C) D.

F'. I# closi#g\$ the T+i4!#al 8ishes to co " " e#d OSLA fo+ its effo+ts i# +eachi#g o!t to all self1+e : +ese#ted a : : lica#ts to : +o:ose its se+ ,ices\$ th!s assisti#g i# allo8i#g to as " a#* of the " : +o:e+ legal +e : +ese#tatio# i# co##ectio# 8ith co " : leK legal iss!es.

Conclusion

G&. I# ,ie8 of the fo+egoi#g\$ the T+i4!#al DECIDES:

The a : : licatio#s a+e +elected as #ot +ecei ,a4le ratione materiae.

=Si , ned@

!dge Te+esa B+a , o

Dated this (&th da* of) a* %&1 '

E#te+ed i# the Registe+ o# this (&th da* of) a* %&1 '

=Si , ned@

Re#.) . / a+gas) .5 Regist+a+5 - e#e , a